Community participation in creating sustainable community-based tourism

Edi Kurniawan, Tri Marhaeni Pudji Astuti, Mohammad Syifauddin

Received: 12 August 2021 | Accepted: 7 November 2021 | Published: 19 November 2021

http://dx.doi.org/10.13135/2384-8677/5997

Correspondence: edikurniawan@mail.unnes.ac.id
Extended authors information available at the end of the article

1. Introduction
2. Literature review
   2.1. Sustainable Tourism and Community Based Tourism
   2.2. Community Participation in Tourism
   2.3. Previous Studies
3. Research Methodology
4. Results and Discussion
   4.1. Community Participation in Creating Sustainable Tourism in Karimunjawa
      4.1.1. Community Participation in the Planning Phase
      4.1.2. Community Participation in the Implementation Phase
      4.1.3. Community Participation in the Supervision Phase
   4.2. Types of Community Participation in Creating a Sustainable Community-Based Tourism in Karimunjawa
5. Conclusions

Keywords: Community-based tourism; Community participation; Sustainable tourism.
Abstract. Tourism is one of the fastest-growing economic sectors in the world. However, the development of tourism in various regions does not necessarily guarantee the welfare of the local community of the tourist destinations. Moreover, there is an inevitable correlation between the rapid growth of tourism and large-scale negative impacts. In promoting sustainable tourism development, national and local government need to pay attention to environmental and cultural preservation. There is also a need to prioritize the interests of local communities to foster a sustainable community-based tourism (CBT). This study analyzes the question of community participation in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa, an archipelago of 27 islands in the Java Sea. Primary and secondary data were collected with snowball sampling selection techniques, using participatory observation, interviews, and documentation. Data analysis was conducted using the interactive analysis method of data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. The results show that the typology of community participation in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa can be classified as the Spontaneous-Induced Participation type – seen from the planning, implementation, and supervision stages. The participation of the Karimunjawa community is the result of the interaction between spontaneous and induced participation. In some of its dimensions, participation is active and bottom-up, while, in others, participation is still top-down and passive. In this respect, we argue that sustainable tourism development will succeed only if spontaneous participation is enhanced. Since the research is limited to the Karimunjawa area, its results cannot be generalized to others. Any further studies need to conduct research on broader or different areas, so that a wider range of similarities and differences can be revealed and analyzed. In this way, it should be possible to identify the characteristics of successful community participation for sustainable tourism development.
1. Introduction

Tourism is one of the fastest growing economic sectors in the world and acts as the main source of income for various developing countries (Sangkakorn and Suwannarat, 2013). Tourism can be a driving force for the growth of numerous related sectors, including hotel, communication and transportation, trade, culinary, and others. It is an economic locomotive providing jobs, income from foreign exchange, strategic markets for potential local products, and support for infrastructure development in various regions. It has the potential to promote equitable development in multiple areas and influence various dimensions of people’s lives, not least in remote areas (Nagarjuna, 2015). The multiplier effect of the tourism industry, together with the fact that it has no boundaries in space nor territorial borders, mean that tourism is a sector that has bright prospects and a high strategic potential to improve the quality of society in the fields of economy, education, culture, politics, and the environment (Aref, Gill, and Aref, 2010; Pramusita and Sinirastiti, 2017).

In the past five years, tourism has become one of the leading sectors playing a role as the backbone for the Indonesian economy (Agfianto, Antara, and Suwardana, 2019). However, the development of tourism in various regions does not necessarily guarantee the welfare of the local community of the tourist destinations. This is because many destinations are still controlled by capitalists largely comprised of people from outside the tourist area (Siqid and Resnawaty, 2019). Instead of increasing economic growth for the benefit of the community, tourism development becomes merely income and profit oriented. It is generally top-down and does not reflect the interests of the local communities (Phanumat, et al., 2015). Moreover, the rapid development of tourism is also directly correlated with large-scale negative impacts caused in the form of environmental degradation, disappearing culture and local wisdom, and changes in people’s lifestyles (Agfianto, Antara, and Suwardana, 2019; Ertuna and Kirbas, 2012; Yazdi, 2012).

Ideally, the development of tourism should pay attention to the preservation of the environment and local culture and involve a significant role for government. The most important thing is to prioritize the interests of local communities (Palimbunga, 2018). Therefore, a shift in the paradigm of tourism development from a capitalist-destructive nature and a top-down approach to a bottom-up approach that guarantees justice and people’s welfare and becomes sustainable is necessary. To realize this, local community participation in tourism development is essential (Aref, 2011). Since local people directly or indirectly feel the positive and negative impacts of tourism, participation on the part of the community is
crucial to ensure the sustainability of tourism as a human activity and economic resources for the areas involved (Adikampana, Sunarta, and Pujani, 2019). Moreover, the local community is also a stakeholder with deep knowledge of the characteristics of their tourism products, their activities, rituals, traditions, culture, and their natural conditions, so that they are best aware of the optimal policies to be taken in tourism development (Kim, Park, and Phandanpuvong, 2014; Salleh, et al., 2016).

Concern over the complexity of such problems has given birth to the concepts of CBT and sustainable tourism. CBT is planned, developed, owned, and managed by the community and for the community, based on decision-making that is collective, responsible, and provides benefits to the community (Giampiccoli and Saayman, 2018). The development of sustainable tourism ensures that natural, social, and cultural resources utilized for tourism in the current generation could also be preserved for future generations.

One of the CBT destinations most concerned with sustainability in Indonesia is Karimunjawa. The tourism industry began to be developed since 2005 to 2006 and the area has become a leading tourism destination with abundant natural potential for marine tourism lovers (Laksono and Massadun, 2014; Qodriyatun, 2018). Karimunjawa is also a National Park area that must be preserved in compliance with the Decree of the Ministry of Forestry and Plantation No. 78/Kpts-II/1999. Moreover, Karimunjawa is a multicultural community area consisting of Javanese, Madura, Bugis, Bajau, and other tribes (Central Statistics Bureau of Jepara Regency, 2018).

This massive tourism potential in Karimunjawa and its unique multicultural community permit researchers to study and analyze various aspects of community participation in realizing sustainable CBT there. Community participation analysis can demonstrate its pattern and typology in various aspects and stages of tourism development. So far, we know of no research that has analyzed the characteristics of community participation in multicultural community-based sustainable tourism in national parks and remote areas such as Karimunjawa. The results should primarily contribute to the scientific literature about community participation and the development of sustainable community-based tourist destinations. Moreover, such community participation typology analysis is crucial as a reference for decision-makers and stakeholders involved in making policies and taking action.
2. Literature Review

2.1 Sustainable Tourism and Community Based Tourism

Sustainable tourism can be considered an effort to create tourism that has a low negative impact on local nature and culture and creates a future-oriented economic distribution beneficial for the local community (Joobi and Satheesh, 2017). In this sense, sustainable tourism refers to tourism that takes full account of current economic, social, and environmental impacts, accommodating the interests of visitors, industry, the environment, and local communities. The sustainability principles consist of three main domains in tourism development: environment, economy, and socio-cultural. These domains must be balanced to ensure long-term sustainability (Aal, 2014). In this way, sustainable tourism is seen as tourism development that means “building together with the society” so that it can produce benefits at the economic, social, and cultural levels for the public and thereby becomes CBT (Munawaroh, 2018). CBT is aimed at addressing disadvantages for the community and is related to strategic sustainability issues regarding empowerment, social justice, and self-reliance (Giampiccoli and Sayman, 2018). Three basic principles of CBT are community involvement in decision-making, the certainty of benefits for the community from tourism activities, and tourism education for the local people. CBT will have implications for the creation of sustainable tourism because tourism development is not only related to how to achieve economic growth but also how to preserve the environment, freeing the economic, political, cultural, and social environment autonomy of the region from subordination towards greater political and economic power (Putra, 2014).

2.2 Community Participation in Tourism

The development of CBT requires a participatory approach because it is tourism organized by the community (Pramusita and Sarinastiti, 2017; Sidiq and Resnawaty, 2019). There are various forms of community participation in tourism (Tosun, 2006). Initially, several authors tried to examine the conditions of community participation in development activities in general, including Pretty (1995) and Arnstein (1969), who categorize forms of community participation in terms of several levels based on the involvement of external parties, local control, and reflecting power relations between them. Subsequently, Tosun (2006) identified three forms: spontaneous, induced, and coercive (Figure 1).
2. Previous Studies

Some previous studies that examined community participation in tourism were conducted by Aref, Gill, and Aref (2010) and Nagarjuna G (2015). Their research suggests that community participation in tourism is crucial because the community is the main reason tourists visit the place. The unique culture, way of life, local products, and the community also forms a landscape. If there is community participation, tourism will also positively impact on society in income generation, equitable development, and improving the quality of education and life in general. Research by Thestane (2019) also suggests that planning, decision making, implementation, and evaluation in tourism must involve the community. Moyo and Tichaawa (2017) conducted a study in Zimbabwe as an example in which the community is less able to develop. Research by Qodriyatun (2018) also shows that current efforts to achieve sustainable tourism in Karimunjawa have still not been realized.

Another study by Guiterrez (2019) suggests that community participation in tourism had different levels in various locations. CBT in the world still suffers from multiple problems. Research by Karta, Sukarsa, Hardini, and Suarthana (2016) and Kim, Park, and Phandanouvong (2014) shows that the low level of competence and awareness of the community and the uneven synchronization of the vision between the community and the government in various regions are crucial causes that hamper the growth of CBT. Research by Sidiq and Resnawaty
(2019) also shows that the asynchronous mission between the government and the community tend to cause excessive domination by the government. People need to get education related to tourism to permit their aspirations to be heard (Moyo and Tichaawa (2017).

3. Research Methodology

Taking account of previous studies, our research was conducted on community participation in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa to identifying what the patterns and typologies of participation are. The research was conducted in the Karimunjawa National Park Area. It was a case study which applied qualitative data collection methods to analyze community participation in realizing sustainable CBT. The analysis will attempt to identify its pattern and typology in various aspects and stages of tourism development. The qualitative approach aims to analyze in-depth images of the complexities of human interactions (Dezin and Lincoln, 1994), to examine in detail the nature of public participation in realizing sustainable CBT.

The study used primary and secondary data sources. Primary data was obtained through direct research in the field which included data on tourism agents in Karimunjawa, the role of the community and actors involved in tourism activities, the interaction between communities in Karimunjawa, and the role of government in tourism in the area. The secondary data consisted of written library sources that could be in the form of books, scientific magazines, archival sources, personal documents, and official documents, including documents, announcements, letters, banners, photos, statistical data, data from the National Park Office Karimunjawa, and popular scientific articles that have been published. Secondary data were also collected through a general literature review, particularly on previous studies and documents from Statistics Indonesia online. The researchers also obtained various kinds of data from both village and sub-district governments directly at their offices.

The subjects of this study were the community and tourism actors, district and village administrations, the management of the Karimunjawa National Park Office, government offices, NGO stakeholders and tourists themselves visiting Karimunjawa. The sample selection was done by using the Snowball Sampling method. Data collection was started by asking the Karimunjawa Sub-district Office and Village Office for permission. Data collection in this research was carried out through participatory observation techniques, interviews, and documentation.
Interviews were carried out in both structured and non-structured modes. Structured interviews were conducted with the government, including the Head of Karimunjawa Sub-district, the Head of Karimunjawa Village, the Chairman of the Indonesian Tour Guides Association (HPI), and Karimunjawa National Park Office employees. At the same time, non-structured interviews were carried out with the community of tourism actors, including members of HPI, ship personnel, traders, homestay owners, tour service providers, and other tourism actors. The researchers acted as tourists by staying in homes owned by members of the local community, participating in tourist tour activities, using the services of boats and tour guides, and buying various products sold by traders. In this way, multiple questions related to community participation were answered spontaneously, and the interviewees could openly provide detailed and objective information. The researchers also conducted participatory observations so that the data obtained was more complete.

The data obtained was analyzed using three channels identified by Milles and Huberman (1992), following the process of data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. The objective was to identify and examine the relationship between the various features that emerged from the field research conducted.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1 Community Participation in Creating Sustainable Tourism in Karimunjawa

Community participation in tourism development is crucial if based on the belief that the community knows best what is needed. Achieving the essence of full participation is when in the community is involved in every dimension of the tourist development stage, including planning, decision making, implementation, and supervision of development programs. In realizing this, careful consideration of the community’s opportunities, willingness, and ability to act are needed.

4.1.1 Community Participation in the Planning Phase

In tourism development in Karimunjawa, the planning system is carried out with both a top-down and a bottom-up approach. The top-down approach involves development planning and program activities related to tourism that derives purely from government policies, either through the Central Java Provincial Tourism Office, the Jepara Regency Tourism Office, the Regional Planning and Development Agency, or from the Karimunjawa National Park Office. The bottom-up approach is development planning that comes from community
initiatives as a form of community action in achieving goals and finding solutions for various problems encountered in tourism activities.

The government’s planning with a top-down approach usually relates to physical development programs that require substantial financial support. Some development programs from the government are the construction and provision of facilities in several tourism destinations, the Karimunjawa Square development plan, the construction of a sports center, the development plan on Bukit Jatikerep, and the cross-cultural facility development plan. Through the tourism office, the government also has a non-physical development program in the form of a Karimunjawa CD-making project as a tourism promotion media. In this planning, the community did not participate in the planning process because the plan had been handled by the government and only sought the community’s approval.

Top-down planning is also carried out by the private sector, such as external investors who develop hotel and resort businesses in the Karimunjawa. This condition creates problems in the development of tourism in Karimunjawa in terms of the economy. It inevitably means that the most significant profits go to the owners of capital. In this way, the community becomes a slave to the tourist industry, facing a process of socio-economic marginalization and enjoying minimal profits. This condition is a sign of resurgent neocolonialism that is starting to penetrate the Karimunjawa region and exploiting local communities, causing social and economic disparities within the tourism industry in Karimunjawa. The community does not participate in planning and does not have the power to obstruct or reject development by external investors.

In contrast to top-down planning, the community participates fully in bottom-up planning because its members are driven by the desire to provide the best for tourism in Karimunjawa and sustainable for themselves and their area. Community participation in the planning stage is reflected in forming groups of tourism actors in Karimunjawa initiated by people who are aware of the tourism potential and threats to the environment and the sociocultural characteristics. These groups have goals, ideals, regulations, and policies that each of their members has agreed on. Rules and policies in each group are arranged based on the vision and mission of each group, in the economic, environmental, social, and cultural fields.

The community participates in the process of decision making, which is decided in a meeting forum organized by each group. The community of the tourism actors also hold some forums to accommodate the aspirations of all groups of
tourism actors. The forum is used to discuss the tourism system in Karimunjawa, including price agreements and service systems, the direction of tourism development, regulations regarding the rules of tourism, policies governing the environment and cultural values, and policies towards tourism actors from outside the area. This forum is also used to discuss planned events related to tourism, for example, Barikan Kubro (an ancient Javanese ritual) events, Sail Indonesia (an annual yacht rally), and others.

4.1.2 Community Participation in the Implementation Phase

Communities have a high level of participation in the implementation phase of tourism, in terms of involvement in the management of tourism businesses and thereby in realizing sustainable CBT.

The Karimunjawa community is a party that embodies the fulfillment of the 3A aspects in tourism (Attraction, Amenities, and Accessibility). It also plays a role in realizing tourist attractions in Karimunjawa, related to something to see, something to do, and something to buy. This condition is reflected in the number of Karimunjawa people who are active in the tourism business. Moreover, many people are engaged in environmental and cultural conservation. This participation is manifested by the active contribution of the people who are members of the groups of tourism actors.


In implementing tourism in Karimunjawa community participation is seen as crucial. This is because the people of Karimunjawa are parties who understand the conditions and potential that exist there. This is very necessary, especially in snorkeling tourism activities, the main base of tourist attractions in Karimunjawa. In snorkeling activities, many local people play the role of tour guides and boat
drivers because of their intimate knowledge of the conditions of the Karimunjawa Sea.

Community participation in tourism activities is also manifested in support for the achievement of Sapta Pesona Wisata in the Karimunjawa region. Sapta Pesona Wisata consists of safe, orderly, clean, relaxed, beautiful, friendly, and memorable. The community actively participates in realizing these conditions, both those directly related to tourism activities as tourism agents and members of the public who are not directly involved in the tourism business.

The values of honesty and friendliness are held firmly by the people of Karimunjawa and are instrumental in bringing about security and order so that tourists feel safe during their visit. The existence of environmental organizations such as the Pitulikur Foundation and other organizations and the presence of routine community service activities play a notable role in maintaining cleanliness, coolness, and beauty in Karimunjawa. This is realized through cleaning the village, harbor, sea, island, beach, and mosque. The community also strives to be a good host always ready to be friendly, help and respect tourists, understand and be tolerant of their needs and behaviors.

The extent of public involvement in the implementation of tourism in Karimunjawa does not guarantee diminishing outside intervention in the tourism business. The increase in tourist influx adds to the intense competition and intervention can come from domestic or foreign countries that directly manage the tourism business in Karimunjawa or capital owners who have workers (confidants) there. Many of them are engaged in hotel and tour package service provision. Some also hold positions regarding management rights or private property rights to beaches or islands which are tourist destinations. This causes profits from the tourism business in Karimunjawa to be enjoyed less by the local community and more by outsiders who tend to be capitalist and exploitative.

4.1.3 Community Participation in the Supervision Phase

The supervision phase is designed to ensure that the range of activities planned and carried out correspond to the targets set despite the changes. Local communities have a substantial role in developing community-based sustainable tourism because control of the decision-making process must be given to those who later bear the consequences of the tourism industry. Supervision of tourism activities is carried out by the Karimunjawa community, who work hand in hand with the Karimunjawa National Park and the Tourism Office.
Community participation in supervision is clearly foreseen by the regulations that are stipulated and carefully overseen by the community. These regulations set the norms that must be maintained and implemented by tourists, such as clothing, prohibition of consumption of liquor, and related to efforts to protect the environment, in line with the fact that most of the community are Muslims. Community participation plays an important role in maintaining the purity of local culture so as it is not by eroded western culture and Karimunjawa remains a sustainable tourist destination in this respect.

Other regulations to maintain the sustainability of nature in Karimunjawa are based on the agreement of all tour operators in the area. The ordinance regulates the obligation to protect the environment, including prohibiting tourists from touching and stepping on the reef during snorkeling and diving activities, the obligation to maintain the cleanliness of beaches, islands, and the sea for all tour operators, tourists, and the public, the obligation to maintain the quality of ships so minimize fuel leakage, including maintaining the quality of land vehicles for travel entrepreneurs to minimize air pollution.

Tour operators also set other regulations regarding tour leaders, tour guides, and sea tour packages. To maintain the sustainability of CBT, there are rules that prohibit external tour leaders and tour guides from conducting sea tours in Karimunjawa. Tour guides from outside the Indonesian Guides Association (HPI) are not allowed to operate. Tour leaders (tour agents) who from outside Karimunjawa are still allowed to come there. However, the tour activities must be managed by the ships and tour guides from Karimunjawa itself. As well as maintaining the overall sustainability of CBT, this is also motivated by the desire to always protect the marine environment since guides from Karimunjawa are better able to understand and care for the local seabed.

Supervision is also carried out by the Karimunjawa National Park, which focuses on environmental sustainability and the biodiversity of land and sea in Karimunjawa. Its supervision envisages regulations regarding zoning of the park area and ensuring the zoning regulations are familiar to the public and tourism actors. The Karimunjawa National Park provides information to the public and tourism actors on how to work together in maintaining environmental sustainability in Karimunjawa. It also conducts a patrol to monitor tourist and community activities in the area.
4.2 Types of Community Participation in Creating a Sustainable Community-Based Tourism in Karimunjawa

The typology of participation is a picture of community involvement in the participation process, with the leading indicator being the power held by the community to influence decision-making. Knowing the typology of community participation will make it easier for stakeholders to help understand the practices and processes of community involvement, find out the extent of efforts to increase community participation, and evaluate stakeholders’ success in increasing community participation. In this study, the typology of community participation in realizing community-based sustainable tourism in Karimunjawa was analyzed in terms of spontaneous and induced features of participation Tosun (2006).

During the planning stage, community participation in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa is both spontaneous and induced. Spontaneous participation is reflected in community initiatives to form a group of tourism actors, then independently determine the objectives, regulations, and policies regarding the direction and organization of tourism activities in the area. Induced Participation occurs in development planning carried out by the government and private investors in Karimunjawa.

During the implementation stage, spontaneous participation could be identified in the active involvement of the members of various groups of tourism actors whose role is to realize aspects of the 3As (Attraction, Accommodation, and Accessibility) and to realize Sapta Pesona Wisata. Induced participation is reflected in the continued intervention of the private sector and the government in implementing tourism in Karimunjawa.

During the supervision stage, community participation still shows spontaneous and induced features. The community plays an important role in monitoring environmental sustainability, preserving cultural values, and ensuring the community’s independence in tourism activities. On the other hand, in tourism activities the community is also still under the supervision of the Karimunjawa National Park.

Thus, we see that the community participation in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa is of the Spontaneous-Induced Participation type, with both features intersecting. In several dimensions, the community has bottom-up participation, is active in achieving its own goals, has considerable power in the decision-making process, has independent planning, and has authentic participation, which is reflected in the awareness of the community to be fully responsible for decisions that have been taken to achieve change.
However, in some dimensions, the community has passive participation in that the government starts participatory actions through strategies to encourage cooperation and support the community. These are largely implemented by the tourism office and Karimunjawa National Park. Thus, what follows is a top-down process leading to pseudo participation, where the community is not involved in making decisions but is involved in implementing decisions taken by other parties. Moreover, the inability of the community to stem the intervention and the presence of investors from outside Karimunjawa has led to induced participation where the community only participated because of the stimulus of possible sharing of economic benefits.

4. Conclusions

Our research leads us to conclude that the typology of community participation at the planning, implementation, and supervision stages in realizing sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa is of the Spontaneous-Induced Participation type. Spontaneous authentic participation based on bottom-up processes coexists with more passive involvement in induced top-down government initiatives and external investment.

Community participation in promoting sustainable CBT in Karimunjawa must certainly be continuously improved. Sustainable tourism development will only succeed if spontaneous participation is fully realized. This allows people to recognize their needs, solve their problems, acquire direction and goals with their specific strategies, and fully participate in the tourism agenda so that the profit will grow over time and feed back into the community. Besides, it will ensure the sustainability of tourism since the community has overall control of the various activities. For this to happen, increasing community capabilities and social capital is an essential process.

Our study has a limitation in that it is a case study that only examines community participation in tourism activities in the Karimunjawa area. Thus, the results are specific and cannot necessarily be generalized and or considered comparable to other sites. Further studies will need to extend research over a broader area, or over several diverse regions so that a range of similarities and differences can be identified and analyzed. In this way, it will be increasingly possible to outline key features for the achievement of community participation and produce a more detailed framework to describe community participation in all the various aspects of tourism development.
References


Decree of the Minister of Forestry and Plantation No. 78/Kpts-II/1999.


**Authors**

**Edi Kurniawan**

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang City, Central Java, Indonesia, 50228.
E.mail: edikurniawan@mail.unnes.ac.id

**Tri Marhaeni Pudji Astuti**

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang City, Central Java, Indonesia, 50228.
E.mail: trimarhaenipudjiastuti@mail.unnes.ac.id

**Mohammad Syifauddin**

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang City, Central Java, Indonesia, 50229.
E.mail: syifauddin31@gmail.com

**Competing Interests**

The authors declared that no competing interests exist.

© 2021 Kurniawan, E., Astuti, T.M.P., Syifauddin, M.

This is an open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).